

## **Joint Statement on Contact Tracing: Date 19th April 2020**

The undersigned represent scientists and researchers from across the globe. The current COVID-19 crisis is unprecedented and we need innovative ways of coming out of the current lockdowns. However, we are concerned that some “solutions” to the crisis may, via mission creep, result in systems which would allow unprecedented surveillance of society at large.

Contact tracing is a well-understood tool to tackle epidemics, and has traditionally been done manually. However, manual contact tracing is time-consuming and is limited to people who can be identified.

In some situations, so-called “contact tracing Apps” on peoples’ smartphones may improve the effectiveness of the manual contact tracing technique. These Apps would allow the persons with whom an infected person had physical interaction to be notified, thus enabling them to go into quarantine. The Apps would work by using Bluetooth or geolocation data present in smartphones. Though the effectiveness of contact tracing Apps is controversial, we need to ensure that those implemented preserve the privacy of their users, thus safeguarding against many other issues, noting that such Apps can otherwise be repurposed to enable unwarranted discrimination and surveillance.

Research has demonstrated that solutions based on sharing geolocation (i.e., GPS) to discover contacts lack sufficient accuracy and also carry privacy risks because the GPS data is sent to a centralized location. For this reason, Bluetooth-based solutions for automated contact tracing are strongly preferred when available.

Some of the Bluetooth-based proposals respect the individual's right to privacy, whilst others would enable (via mission creep) a form of government or private sector surveillance that would catastrophically hamper trust in and acceptance of such an application by society at large. It is crucial that citizens trust the applications in order to produce sufficient uptake to make a difference in tackling the crisis. It is vital that, in coming out of the current crisis, we do not create a tool that enables large scale data collection on the population, either now or at a later time. Thus, solutions which allow reconstructing invasive information about the population should be rejected without further discussion. Such information can include the “social graph” of who someone has physically met over a period of time.

With access to the social graph, a bad actor (state, private sector, or hacker) could spy on citizens’ real-world activities. Some countries are seeking to build systems which could enable them to access and process this social graph. On the other hand, highly decentralized systems have no distinct entity that can learn anything about the social graph. In such systems, matching between users who have the disease and those who do not is performed on the non-infected users’ phones as anonymously as possible, whilst information about non-infected users is not revealed at all.

To aid the development of contact tracing without a centrally controlled database that holds private information on individuals, Google and Apple are developing infrastructure to enable the required Bluetooth operations in a privacy protective manner. Teams building the privacy

protective schemes fully support this effort as it simplifies—and thus speeds up—the ability to develop such Apps. We applaud this initiative and caution against collecting private information on users. Some who seek to build centralized systems are pressuring Google and Apple to open up their systems to enable them to capture more data.

It is worth noting that the European Parliament on April 17th gave their support to the decentralized approach, pointing out by overwhelming majority "that [...] the generated data are not to be stored in centralised databases, which are prone to potential risk of abuse and loss of trust and may endanger uptake throughout the Union" and demanding "that all storage of data be decentralised".

There are a number of proposals for contact tracing methods which respect users' privacy, many of which are being actively investigated for deployment by different countries. We urge all countries to rely only on systems that are subject to public scrutiny and that are privacy preserving **by design** (instead of there being an expectation that they will be managed by a trustworthy party), as a means to ensure that the citizen's data protection rights are upheld

The following principles should be at least adopted going forward:

- Contact tracing Apps must only be used to support public health measures for the containment of COVID-19. The system must not be capable of collecting, processing, or transmitting any more data than what is necessary to achieve this purpose.
- Any considered solution must be fully transparent. The protocols and their implementations, including any sub-components provided by companies, must be available for public analysis. The processed data and if, how, where, and for how long they are stored must be documented unambiguously. Such data collected should be minimal for the given purpose.
- When multiple possible options to implement a certain component or functionality of the app exist, then the most privacy-preserving option must be chosen. Deviations from this principle are only permissible if this is necessary to achieve the purpose of the app more effectively, and must be clearly justified with sunset provisions.
- The use of contact tracing Apps and the systems that support them must be voluntary, used with the explicit consent of the user and the systems must be designed to be able to be switched off, and all data deleted, when the current crisis is over.

## **Signed:**

### **Australia**

Prof. Dali Kaafar  
Prof. Vanessa Teague  
Dr. Yuval Yarom

Macquarie University  
Thinking Cybersecurity and Australian National University  
The University of Adelaide and Data61

### **Austria**

Prof. Daniel Gruss  
Prof. Stefan Mangard  
Prof. Elisabeth Oswald

Graz University of Technology  
Graz University of Technology  
University of Klagenfurt

Prof. Christian Rechberger      Graz University of Technology

### **Belgium**

Prof. Claudia Diaz      KU Leuven  
Prof. Mireille Hildebrandt      VU Brussels  
Prof. Wouter Joosen      KU Leuven  
Prof. Nele Mentens      KU Leuven  
Prof. Bart De Moor      KU Leuven      Fellow IEEE and SIAM  
Prof. Yves Moreau      KU Leuven      Fellow ISCB  
Prof. Olivier Pereira      UC Louvain  
Prof. Frank Piessens      KU Leuven  
Prof. Bart Preneel      KU Leuven      Fellow IACR  
Prof. Jean-Jacques Quisquater      UCLouvain      Fellow IACR, Member of Belgium Royal Academy  
Prof. Nigel Smart      KU Leuven      Fellow IACR  
Prof. François-Xavier Standaert      UC Louvain  
Prof. Joos Vandewalle      KU Leuven      Fellow IEEE, IET, Eurasip, Member Royal Academy  
of Belgium and Academia Europaea  
Prof. Ingrid Verbauwhede      KU Leuven      Fellow IEEE and Royal Academy of Belgium  
Prof. Frederik Vercauteren      KU Leuven  
Dr. Mathias Vermeulen      VU Brussels

### **Brazil**

Prof. Mário S. Alvim      Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais

### **Canada**

Prof. Vijay Ganesh      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Ian Goldberg      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Sergey Gorbunov      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Xi He      University of Waterloo.  
Prof. Florian Kerschbaum      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Marc-Olivier Killijian      Université du Québec à Montréal  
Prof. Ali José Mashtizadeh      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Alfred Menezes      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Bessma Momani      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Michele Mosca      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Paul van Oorschot      Carleton University      Fellow ACM, IEEE and Royal Soc. Canada  
Prof. Douglas Stebila      University of Waterloo  
Prof. Charles Taylor      McGill University

### **Denmark**

Prof. Ivan Damgård      Aarhus University      Fellow IACR  
Prof. Claudio Orlandi      Aarhus University

### **Estonia**

Dr. Dan Bogdanov      Cybernetica

### **Finland**

Prof. Chris Brzuska      Aalto University

### **France**

Prof. Davide Balzarotti      EURECOM  
Prof. Karim Belabas      University of Bordeaux  
Dr. Olivier Blazy      University of Limoges  
Dr. Jean-François Couchot      University of Franche-Comté  
Prof. Aurélien Francillon      EURECOM  
Prof. Nadia El Mrabet      HDR Mines Saint-Etienne  
Dr. Rémi Géraud-Stewart      CentraleSupélec

Prof. Jean-Gabriel Ganascia	Sorbonne University	Fellow EURAI
Prof. Louis Goubin	University of Versailles St-Quentin-en-Yvelines	
Prof. Stefan Haar	INRIA (Mexico Team)	
Prof. David Kohel	Aix-Marseille University	
Dr. Pascal Lafourcade	University Clermont Auvergne	
Dr. Benoît Libert	ENS Lyon and CNRS	
Prof. Francois Morain	LIX, Ecole Polytechnique	
Prof. David Naccache	ENS Paris	
Prof. Melek Önen	EURECOM	
Dr. Pascal Paillier	Zama	
Prof. Benjamin Nguyen	INSA Centre Val de Loire	
Prof. Michaël Quisquater	University of Versailles	
Prof. Damien Stehlé	ENS Lyon	
Prof. Jacques Stern	ENS Paris	Fellow IACR
Prof. Massimiliano Todisco	EURECOM	

### Germany

Prof. Michael Backes	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	Fellow IEEE
Prof. Eric Bodden	Heinz Nixdorf Institute at Paderborn University & Fraunhofer IEM	
Prof. Georg Borges	Saarland University	
Dr. Sven Bugiel	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Stefan Brunthaler	Universität der Bundeswehr München	
Prof. Cas Cremers	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Dr. Jean Paul Degabriele	TU Darmstadt	
Dr. Alexander Dix	European Academy for Freedom of Information and Data Protection	
Prof. Christian Djéffal	TU München	
Prof. Hannes Federrath	University of Hamburg	President of German Computer Society
Prof. Bernd Finkbeiner	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Dr. Michael Friedewald	Fraunhofer ISI	
Prof. Mario Fritz	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Sascha Fahl	Leibniz University Hannover	
Prof. Nils Fleischhacker	Ruhr-Universität Bochum	
Prof. Dominik Herrmann	University of Bamberg	
Prof. Jeanette Hofmann	Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin für Sozialforschung	
Prof. Thorsten Holz	Ruhr-Universität Bochum	
Prof. Albert Ingold	Johannes Gutenberg Universität Mainz	
Dr. Swen Jacobs	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Tibor Jager	University of Wuppertal	
Dr. Ghassan Karame	NEC Laboratories Europe	
Dr. Christian Katzenbach	Humboldt Institute for Internet and Society, Berlin	
Prof. Eike Kiltz	Ruhr-Universität Bochum	
Dr. Dennis-Kenji Kipker	European Academy for Freedom of Information and Data Protection	
Prof. Teresa Koloma Beck	Universität der Bundeswehr München	
Dr. Katharina Krombholz	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Jörn Lamla	Universität Kassel	
Prof. Gregor Leander	Ruhr-Universität Bochum	
Prof. Anja Lehmann	Hasso-Plattner-Institute and University of Potsdam	
Ms. Ninja Marnau	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Mira Mezini	TU Darmstadt	Member Nat. Acad. of Engineering Sciences
Prof. Patrizia Nanz	University of Potsdam	
Prof. Paul Nolte	Freie Universität Berlin	
Prof. Christof Paar	Max Planck Inst. CyberSec. and Privacy	Fellow IACR and IEEE
Dr. Sebastian Pape	Goethe University Frankfurt	
Dr. Giancarlo Pellegrino	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Hartmut Pohl	softScheck GmbH	
Dr. Tina Pollmann	TU München	
Prof. Jörn Müller-Quade	KIT Karlsruhe	
Prof. Kai Rannenberg	Goethe University Frankfurt	Vice President IFIP

Prof. Steffen Reith	RheinMain University of Applied Sciences	
Prof. Elisa Resconi	TU München	
Prof. Alexander Roßnagel	University of Kassel	
Prof. M Angela Sasse	Ruhr Universität Bochum	
Prof. Ina Schiering	Ostfalia University of Applied Sciences	
Prof. Sebastian Schinzel	Münster University of Applied Sciences	
Prof. Stefan Schönert	TU München	
Prof. Jörg Schwenk	Ruhr University Bochum	
Prof. Juraj Somorovsky	Paderborn University	
Prof. Christoph Sorge	Universität des Saarlandes	
Dr. Ben Stock	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Thorsten Strufe	KIT Karlsruhe and CeTI TU Dresden	
Dr. Nils Ole Tippenhauer	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Jilles Vreeken	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	
Prof. Andreas Zeller	CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security	Fellow ACM

### India

Prof. Subhamoy Maitra	Indian Statistical Institute	
Dr. Mridul Nandi	Indian Statistical Institute	
Prof. Manoj Prabhakaran	IIT Bombay	
Dr. Somitra Kr. Sanadhya	IIT Ropar	
Prof. Sandeep Kumar Shukla	IIT Kanpur	Fellow IEEE

### Italy

Prof. Rainer Bauböck	European University Institute, Florence
Prof. Carlo Blundo	Università di Salerno
Prof. Dario Catalano	Università di Catania
Prof. Ciro Cattuto	University of Turin
Prof. Giovanni Comandé	Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Pisa
Prof. Mauro Conti	Università di Padova
Prof. Giuseppe Persiano	Università di Salerno
Prof. Daniele Venturi	Sapienza University of Rome
Prof. Ivan Visconti	University of Salerno

### Israel

Prof. Katya Assaf	Hebrew University
Prof. Yehuda Lindell	Bar-Ilan University
Prof. Benny Pinkas	Bar-Ilan University

### Japan

Prof. Tetsu Iwata	Nagoya University
Prof. Kazuo Sakiyama	UEC Tokyo

### Luxembourg

Prof. Peter Y A Ryan	University of Luxembourg
----------------------	--------------------------

### Portugal

Dr. Manuel Barbosa	University of Porto (FCUP) and INESC TEC
--------------------	--

### Mexico

Dr. Cuauhtemoc Mancillas-López	CINVESTAV-IPN
Dr. Brisbane Ovilla-Martínez	CINVESTAV-IPN
Dr. Francisco Rodríguez-Henríquez	CINVESTAV-IPN

### The Netherlands

Prof. Lejla Batina	Radboud University
Prof. Peter Boncz	CWI Amsterdam and VU University Amsterdam

Prof. Jos Baeten	CWI Amsterdam and University of Amsterdam
Prof. Ronald Cramer	CWI Amsterdam and Leiden University Fellow IACR
Prof. Joan Daemen	Radboud University
Prof. Arie van Deursen	TU Delft
Prof. Aaron Ding	TU Delft
Dr. Leo Ducas	CWI Amsterdam
Prof. Michel van Eeten	TU Delft
Prof. Serge Fehr	CWI Amsterdam and Leiden University
Prof. Tobias Fiebig	TU Delft
Prof. Natali Helberger	University of Amsterdam
Prof. Lisa Herzog	University of Groningen
Prof. Marijn Janssen	TU Delft
Prof. Tanja Lange	Eindhoven University of Technology
Prof. Arno R. Lodder	Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
Prof. Veelasha Moonsamy	Radboud University
Prof. Stefanie Roos	TU Delft
Prof. Peter Schwabe	Radboud University
Dr. Benne de Weger	Eindhoven University of Technology
Dr. Philip Zimmermann	TU Delft

### **New Zealand**

Prof. Steven Galbraith	University of Auckland
------------------------	------------------------

### **Norway**

Prof. Kristian Gjøsteen	NTNU
-------------------------	------

### **Slovenia**

Prof. Marko Holbl	University of Maribor
-------------------	-----------------------

### **Spain**

Prof. Manuel Carro	IMDEA Software Institute and Technical University of Madrid
Prof. Ignacio Cascudo	IMDEA Software Institute
Gemma Galdon Clavell	Eticas Foundation
Prof. Dario Fiore	IMDEA Software Institute
Prof. Ramon Lopez de Mantaras	Artificial Intelligence Research Institute Fellow of EurAI
Prof. Juan Tapiador	UC3M
Prof. Narseo Vallina-Rodriguez	IMDEA Networks Institute
Prof. María Isabel González Vasco	Universidad Rey Juan Carlos

### **Sweden**

Prof. Rose-Mharie Åhlfeldt	University of Skövde
Dr. Matthias Beckerle	Karlstad University
Prof. Simone Fischer-Hübner	Karlstad University
Dr. Leonardo Martucci	Karlstad University
Mr. Linus Nordberg	DFRI
Dr. Tobias Pulls	Karlstad University

### **Switzerland**

Prof. David Basin	ETH Zurich	Fellow ACM
Dr. Peter Berlich	ZHAW	
Dr. Jan Beutel	ETH Zurich	
Prof. Edouard Bugnion	EPFL	Fellow ACM
Prof. Christian Cachin	University of Bern	Fellow ACM and IEEE
Prof. Srdjan Čapkun	ETH Zurich	Fellow ACM
Prof. Bryan Ford	EPFL	
Prof. Dennis Hofheinz	ETH Zurich	
Prof. Jean-Pierre Hubaux	EPFL	Fellow ACM and IEEE
Prof. James Larus	EPFL	Fellow ACM

Prof. Ueli Maurer	ETH Zurich	Fellow ACM, IACR and IEEE
Prof. Adrian Perrig	ETH Zurich	Fellow ACM
Prof. Kenny Paterson	ETH Zurich	Fellow IACR
Prof. Mathias Payer	EPFL	
Prof. Kaveh Razavi	ETH Zurich	
Prof. Marcel Salathé	EPFL	
Prof. Carmela Troncoso	EPFL	

### United Arab Emirates

Prof. Christina Pöpper	New York University, Abu Dhabi.
------------------------	---------------------------------

### United Kingdom

Prof. Martin Albrecht	Royal Holloway, University of London	
Dr. Reuben Binns	University of Oxford	
Prof. Lorenzo Cavallaro	King's College London	
Prof. Liqun Chen	University of Surrey	
Prof. Carlos Cid	Royal Holloway, University of London	
Dr. Jennifer Cobbe	University of Cambridge	
Prof. Jon Crowcroft	University of Cambridge	Fellow ACM and IEEE
Prof. George Danezis	UCL	
Prof. Lilian Edwards	Newcastle University	
Prof. Flavio Garcia	University of Birmingham	
Dr. Robert Granger	University of Surrey	
Dr. Jassim Happa	Royal Holloway, University of London.	
Dr. Rikke Bjerg Jensen	Royal Holloway, University of London	
Dr. Philipp Jovanovic	UCL	
Prof. Aggelos Kiayias	University of Edinburgh	
Prof. Christopher Marsden	University of Sussex	
Prof. Keith Martin	Royal Holloway, University of London	
Prof. Ivan Martinovic	University of Oxford	
Dr. Tim Muller	University of Nottingham	
Dr. Dan Page	University of Bristol	
Dr. Elizabeth Quaglia	Royal Holloway, University of London	
Prof. Mark D. Ryan	University of Birmingham	
Prof. Burkhard Schafer	University of Edinburgh	
Prof. Steve Schneider	University of Surrey	Fellow IET
Dr. Jat Singh	University of Cambridge	
Prof. Max Van Kleek	University of Oxford	
Dr. Michael Veale	UCL	
Prof. Alan Woodward	University of Surrey	Fellow BCS and InstP
Dr. Vassiles Zikas	University of Edinburgh	

### United States of America

Prof. Alessandro Acquisti	Carnegie Mellon University	
Dr. Johanna Amann	ICSI	
Prof. Adam Bates	Uni. of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign	
Prof. Lujó Bauer	Carnegie Mellon University	
Prof. Mihir Bellare	UC San Diego	Fellow ACM and IACR
Prof. Daniel J. Bernstein	University of Illinois at Chicago	
Prof. Matt Blaze	Georgetown University	
Prof. Vincent Bindschaedler	University of Florida	
Prof. Dan Boneh	Stanford University	Fellow ACM, IACR, US Nat. Acad. of Eng.
Prof. Kevin Butler	University of Florida	
Dr. Jon Callas	ACLU	
Prof. L. Jean Camp	Indiana University	Fellow AAAS, IEEE
Prof. Ran Canetti	Boston University	Fellow IACR
Deirdre Connolly	Zcash Foundation	
Prof. Nicolas Christin	Carnegie Mellon Uni.	

Prof. Lorrie Cranor	Carnegie Mellon Uni. Fellow ACM and IEEE
Prof. Anupam Das	North Carolina State Uni.
Prof. Srinivas Devadas	MIT Fellow ACM and IEEE
Prof. Sven Dietrich	City University of New York
Prof. Marten van Dijk	University of Connecticut and CWI
Prof. Jintai Ding	University of Cincinnati
Roger Dingledine	The Tor Project
Dr. Roel Dobbe	AI Now Institute (New York)
Prof. Manuel Egele	Boston University
Prof. William Enck	North Carolina State Uni.
Prof. Shyam Gollakota	University of Washington
Prof. Matthew D. Green	Johns Hopkins University
Prof. Rachel Greenstadt	New York University
Prof. Giulia Fanti	Carnegie Mellon University
Prof. Dean Foster	Uni. of Pennsylvania Fellow IMS and Game Theory Society
Prof. Michael Franz	UC Irvine Fellow AAAS, ACM, IEEE, and IFIP
Prof. Britta Hale	Naval Postgraduate School
Dr. Mike Hamburg	Rambus
Dr. Helena Handschuh	Rambus Fellow
Prof. Trent Jaeger	Pennsylvania State University
Prof. Somesh Jha	Uni. of Wisconsin, Madison
Prof. Sham Kakade	University of Washington
Prof. Aniket Kate	Purdue University
Prof. Jonathan Katz	George Mason Uni. Fellow IACR
Dr. Hugo Krawczyk	Algorand Foundation Fellow IACR
Dr. Kristin E. Lauter	Microsoft Research Fellow AMS, SIAM and AWM
Prof. Susan Landau	Tufts University Fellow ACM and AAAS
Prof. Tadayoshi Kohno	University of Washington
Dr. John Langford	Microsoft Research President of ICML
Dr. Timothy Libert	Carnegie Mellon University
Prof. Anna Lysyanskaya	Brown University
Prof. David Mazières	Stanford University
Prof. Michelle Mazurek	University of Maryland, College Park
Prof. Patrick McDaniel	Pennsylvania State Uni.
Prof. Prateek Mittal	Princeton University
Prof. Rafail Ostrovsky	UCLA Fellow IACR, IEEE, Member Academia Europea
Prof. Aanjhan Ranganathan	Northeastern University
Prof. Bradley Reaves	North Carolina State Uni.
Prof. Franziska Roesner	University of Washington
Prof. Phil Rogaway	UC Davis Fellow IACR
Mr. Gregory Rose	Deckard Technologies, Inc.
Prof. Norman Sadeh	Carnegie Mellon University
Prof. Alessandra Scafuro	North Carolina State Uni.
Prof. Patrick Schaumont	Worcester Polytechnic Institute
Prof. Micah Sherr	Georgetown University
Prof. Thomas Shrimpton	University of Florida
Prof. Dawn Song	Fellow ACM, IEEE
Prof. Philip B. Stark	UC Berkeley Fellow ASA, Inst. Phys. and Royal Astronomy Soc.
Prof. Stefano Tessaro	University of Washington
Prof. Patrick Traynor	University of Florida
Prof. Lyle Ungar	University of Pennsylvania
Henry de Valence	Zcash Foundation
Prof. Mayank Varia	Boston University
Prof. XiaoFeng Wang	Indiana University Fellow IEEE
Mr John Wilkinson	MIT
Prof. Byron Williams	University of Florida
Prof. Laurie Williams	N. Carolina State Uni. Fellow IEEE
Prof. Matthew Wright	Rochester Institute of Technology



Prof. Dongyan Xu  
Prof. Xiangyu Zhang

Purdue University  
Purdue University

## Appendix:

Privacy-preserving decentralized methods of the type referred to in this document include:

**DP-3T:** <https://github.com/DP-3T>

**TCN Coalition:** <https://tcn-coalition.org/>

**PACT (MIT):** <https://pact.mit.edu/>

**PACT (UW):** <https://covidsafe.cs.washington.edu/>

All these teams are committed to working together to make their systems interoperate. They aim to provide different decentralized privacy preserving methods which can be adapted by countries depending on their local situation. By working together they can ensure that using contact tracing in the effort to defeat COVID-19 can be done in a way that protects privacy.

### **Any media contacts should be sent to one of**

**US Press:**

**James Larus:**

**EU Press:**

**Kenny Paterson:**

**UK Press:**

**Michael Veale:**

**RoW:**

**Nigel Smart:**

**Dutch/French**

**Bart Preneel:**

**German:**

**Cas Cremers:**

**Spanish:**

**Carmela Troncoso:**

**Italian:**

**Dario Fiore:**